Advantages and Disadvantages

	ADVANTAGES	DISADVANTAGES
No Build/Repair: 10-Year Service Life		
• Install cathodic protection pile jackets • Repair the fender system • Upgrade drawbridge electrical system • Repair concrete (sealing cracks, patching spalls, etc.) in the piles, pile caps, deck, beams, and traffic railing • Repair the drawbridge operational machinery • Replace the beams, deck, and traffic railing on 6 of the fixed spans • Repair and paint drawbridge steel • Install 10 crutch bents • Requires 9-week bridge closure	• No acquisition of right-of-way (ROW) or submerged land easements • Lowest initial cost compared to Rehabilitation and Replacement alternatives • No impacts to utilities • No height restrictions for boats • No mangrove and seagrass impacts	• Nine-week bridge closure and detour via Anna Maria Bridge (12 miles, 23 minutes) and Ringling Bridge (32 miles, 53 minutes) • A short service life (10 years), then replacement is needed • Bridge will continue to be functionally obsolete for the life of the structure (i.e. no shoulders, not designed to current structural and safety standards) • Continued and increasing operation, maintenance, and repair costs • Continued safety concerns associated with the raised curb and lack of adequate shoulders • Continued safety concerns associated with the substandard traffic railings • Continued safety concerns associated with vessels impacting the piles • Continued concern for effective and reliable hurricane evacuation and recovery should mechanical systems malfunction or vehicles become disabled, blocking the through lane • No improvement in water quality in Anna Maria Sound/Sarasota Bay since stormwater will not be treated • Continued vehicular delay caused by the drawbridge openings • Continued delay as vessels wait for bridge to open • Continued vulnerability of the bridge to wave action in severe storms • No benefit of additional 10 foot horizontal clearance between fenders • Repairs would not prevent the need to post the bridge for weight restrictions, meaning that heavy trucks could be restricted • No aesthetic improvements
Rehabilitation: 25-Year Service Life		
• Replace all the beams, deck, and traffic railing of the fixed spans • Install cathodic protection pile jackets • Install 10 crutch bents • Repair concrete (sealing cracks, patching spalls, etc.) in the piles, pile caps, deck, beams, and traffic railing • Replace the fender system • Replace electrical and mechanical systems • Repair and paint drawbridge steel • Replace curbs and non-crash tested bridge railings on drawbridge • Requires a temporary bridge ($14.6M)	• No acquisition of ROW or submerged land easements • Minimal impacts to utilities • No height restrictions for boats • No permanent mangrove and seagrass impacts • Repairs would prevent the need to post the bridge for weight restrictions, meaning that heavy trucks would not be restricted	• A relatively short service life (25 years), then replacement is needed • Bridge will continue to be functionally obsolete for the life of the structure (i.e. no shoulders, not designed to current structural and safety standards) • Continued and increasing costs, including bridge tender, maintenance costs, and repair costs • Continued safety concerns associated with the lack of adequate shoulders • Continued safety concerns associated with vessels impacting the piles • Continued concern for effective and reliable hurricane evacuation and recovery should mechanical systems malfunction or vehicles become disabled, blocking the through lane • No improvement in water quality in Anna Maria Sound/Sarasota Bay since stormwater will not be treated • Continued vehicular delay caused by the drawbridge openings • Continued delay as vessels wait for bridge to open • Continued vulnerability of the bridge to wave action in severe storms • No aesthetic improvements • No benefit of additional 10-ft horizontal guide clearance between fenders • Requires a temporary bridge ($14.6M) • Impacts of temporary bridge and roadway connections on land and marine environment including minor mangrove and seagrass impacts
Replacement – Low-Level Drawbridge: 75-Year Service Life		
• Replace existing bridge with Low-Level Drawbridge	• No height restrictions for boats • Improvement in water quality in Anna Maria Sound/Sarasota Bay due to treatment of stormwater runoff • Improved safety and functional adequacy of bridge due to added shoulders, a wider sidewalk, a crash tested barrier, and increased resistance to ship impact and storm surge • Increased horizontal distance between the fenders will accommodate safer navigation • 8-ft sidewalks are an improvement over the existing sidewalks and accommodate multiple users, including pedestrians, fishermen, bicyclists, and other recreational users • Similar visual impacts relative to existing bridge height • Similar grades for pedestrians to cross bridge relative to existing bridge grades • No additional ROW is required • Long Service Life (75 years) • Similar visual impacts relative to existing bridge height • Traffic can use existing bridge while replacement is being constructed • No restrictions for heavy trucks	• Continued vehicular delay caused by the drawbridge openings • Continued delay as vessels wait for draw bridge to open • Potential effects on the natural environment • Continued operating costs due to the need for a bridge tender • Requires acquisition of submerged land easement for fenders • Minor mangrove and seagrass impacts • Utility impacts
Replacement – Mid-Level Drawbridge: 75-Year Service Life		
• Replace existing bridge with Mid-Level Drawbridge	• No height restrictions for boats • Reduced traffic delays due to fewer drawbridge openings • Improvement in water quality in Anna Maria Sound due to treatment of stormwater runoff • No additional ROW is required • Improved safety and functional adequacy of bridge due to added shoulders, a wider sidewalk, a crash tested barrier, and increased resistance to ship impact and storm surge • Increased horizontal distance between the fenders will accommodate safer navigation • The 45-ft navigation height will allow over 50 percent of the boats that currently require the bridge to open to pass under the closed bridge • 8-ft sidewalks are an improvement over the existing sidewalks and accommodate multiple users, including pedestrians, fishermen, bicyclists, and other recreational users • Long Service Life (75 years) • Traffic can use existing bridge while replacement is being constructed • No restrictions for heavy trucks	• Continued vehicular delay caused by the drawbridge openings, though fewer openings than today • Continued delay as vessels wait for draw bridge to open; though fewer openings than today • Continued operating costs due to the need for a bridge tender • Greater visual impacts relative to the existing bridge height • Potential effects on the natural environment • Steeper grades for pedestrians to cross bridge relative to existing bridge grades, but still meets ADA standards • Requires acquisition of submerged land easement for fenders • Minor mangrove and seagrass impacts • Utility impacts
Replacement - High-Level Fixed Bridge: 75-Year Service Life		
• Replace existing bridge with High-Level Fixed Bridge	• Improvement in water quality in Anna Maria Sound due to treatment of stormwater runoff • No operating costs since no bridge tender is required • Significant operational improvements and no vehicular delay from drawbridge openings • Improved safety and functional adequacy of the bridge due to added shoulders, a wider sidewalk, a crash tested barrier, and increased resistance to ship impact and storm surge • 8-ft sidewalks are an improvement over the existing sidewalks and accommodate multiple users, including pedestrians, fishermen, bicyclists, and other recreational users • Increased horizontal distance between the fenders will accommodate safer navigation • Long Service Life (75 years) • Traffic can use existing bridge while replacement is being constructed • No restrictions for heavy trucks	• 65-ft bridge height will not allow 2% of current boat traffic under bridge • Potential effects on the natural environment • Greater visual impacts relative to the existing bridge height • Steeper grades for pedestrians to cross bridge relative to existing bridge grades, but still meets ADA standards • Additional ROW is required to maintain access to a residential parcel east of 127th Street West (North Alignment Only) • Access changes required on east end of bridge – Realignment of 127th Street West to the east – SR 684 (Cortez Road) passing over the existing 127th Street West – Two local driveways relocated from Cortez Road to 127th Street West – Direct access to Central Avenue from SR 684 (Cortez Road) cut off • Requires acquisition of submerged land easement for fenders • Minor mangrove and seagrass impacts • Utility impacts